Plagiarism across Europe and beyond Mendel University, May 24 – 26, 2017

Petra Hauptfeld & Natascha Miljković
To whom belongs the idea?
Discussing plagiarism at universities from the perspective of ownership
“Yes, I am a thief of thoughts”
Bob Dylan
“Immature poets imitate; mature poets steal; bad poets deface what they take, and good poets make it into something better, or at least something different.”

“Talent imitates, genius steals”, attributed to Oscar Wilde, Pablo Picasso and Steve Jobs.
Bob Dylan

„Quotation is something that happens a lot in the music world. Merle Haggard can mimic Johnny Cash and Willie Nelson perfectly. The Beatles mimic the Beach Boys. Quotation is a phrase that is used all the time in jazz solos. (...) One song is always using a line in another song to brace it. But then goes on to another tangent.“

Interview 2011, in: Detering, 2016²
Quotation in the sense of using lines from others embeds a special thought in its tradition and/or history.

Ownership belongs to the phrasing?
Phrasing

„I thought that the rain would cool things down/ But it looks like it don‘t“
Bob Dylan, Seeing The Real You At Last

„Think this rain would cool things off, but it don‘t“
Humphrey Bogart in John Huston: Key Largo

→ changes for the rhythm
→ metaphors: rain washes away all pain/sins
Quotation in lyrics, film and poetry provokes a recognition of thoughts in order to play with archetypes and role models.

Ownership belongs to the new construction of context.
New context

Shakespeare
Woody Guthrie
John Lennon
Homer
Ovid
Mark Twain
T. S. Eliot
Quotation is a creative writing process where different voices from different ages are cited to bring them into a polyphonic dialogue.

Ownership belongs to the creative collage technique of intertextuality.
Roll on John: „A thousand and one voices“

I heard the news today, oh boy
They hauled your ship up on the shore
Now the city’s gone dark, there is no more joy
They tore the heart right out and cut it to the core.

Shine your light/move it on/You burned so bright/Roll on John

Slow down your moving way too fast
Come together right now over me
Your bones are weary, you’re about to breathe your last
Lord you know how hard it can be
By arranging polyphonic voices from different sources, quotation serves as a “timeless and eternal” instrument.

Ownership belongs to the inventive arrangement of quotes for this effect.
„Timeless and eternal“ quotes

Dylan: “The people in my songs are all me. (…) If you have these kinds of thoughts and feelings you know where the guy is. He is right where you are. If you don’t have those thoughts and feelings then he doesn’t exist.”

- identification with the text, e.g. quotes
- cultural context, “America is singing”
- collective and free from individual settings
Quotation can be used for uniting popular culture and “high culture” showing that this separation is randomly.

Ownership belongs to the creation of a new cultural style.
Shakespeare

The path is ever winding
The stars they never age
The morning light is blinding
All the world’s at stage"

Dylan, Can‘t Escape from You
Shakespeare, As you like it

My clothes are wet, tight on my skin
Not as tight as the corner that I painted myself in
I know that fortune is waiting to be kind
So give me your hand and say you will be mine

Dylan, Mississippi
Shakespeare, Measure for Measure
## Switching worlds

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>in popular culture</th>
<th>in sciences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>re-own</strong></td>
<td>yes!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>re-use</strong></td>
<td>yes!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>process</strong></td>
<td>creative, artistic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>context/functions of quotations</strong></td>
<td>homage to other artists/honoring, copyright issues, ...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>goals</strong></td>
<td>sell „new“/more products, sell re-issues, ...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Example #1 – full plagiarism

**NO concept** of (re-owning and) re-using in sciences was understood and why we write texts after all!

„Quick fix“ to **show some form of performance**

**Pure egoism?**

„**Economical“/ not sweating coming up with an argumentation**

Are teachers to blame? → we expect „something“ to grade, maybe everything seems to be better than nothing at all?
Example #2 – „shake & paste“

Again concept of re-owning and re-using **not understood**

Even if proper citation given **no own argumentation** makes it worthless

**Functions why we cite in scientific texts NOT understood!**

Possibly greater problem **amongst exchange students from different science cultures?!**
Example #3 – „The Phrase Juggling“

Re-using by re-arranging ok **IF own ideas included** and up for discussion

Possibly not aware of **value and reliability of sources?**

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Seite: 86, Zeilen: 11-22</td>
<td>Seite(n): 0, Zeilen: 0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Example #4 – „The Synonym Tango“

“Investing in America”
The White House, January 2012

- From 2001 to 2007, investment in equipment and software to make companies more productive declined by 15% as a share of GDP.¹

- Real business fixed investment has begun to rebound, growing by 18% since the end of 2009.²

- The manufacturing sector has recovered faster than the rest of the economy, supporting growth and job creation. Over the past two years, the economy has added 334,000 manufacturing jobs with it we have seen strong growth in exports. Over the past twelve months, exports have been growing at an annualized rate of 15.1% when compared with 2009, meaning that America is ahead of schedule in meeting the President’s goal of doubling exports over 2009 levels by the end of 2014. As of October, American exports of goods and services over the past 12 months

U.S. workers are more productive than those of any other G-20 economy, and U.S. productivity growth trading partners has risen, in some cases substantially, as is shown in Figure 4. Of the 19 countries tracked by the BLS, only Taiwan managed to improve its unit labor cost position more than the U.S.²¹

Zakaria, “The economic lessons the rest of the world…”
The Washington Post, January 18, 2012

the massive boom in residential real estate. From 2001 to 2007, investment in equipment and software — the kinds of investments that boost productivity and create good jobs — declined 15 percent as a share of gross domestic product. The economy recovered after the recession of 2000, but the recovery was powered almost entirely by government spending, cheap credit and a real estate bubble.

In contrast, the current recovery, while anemic in terms of number of jobs created, is more broad-based and more durable. Business investment is rising, having boomed 18 percent since the end of 2009. Manufacturing has rebounded faster than other sectors, adding 334,000 jobs over the past two years. Exports are growing at an annualized rate of 16 percent, which means that U.S. exports should double earlier than 2014, the goal President Obama set in 2009. Labor productivity in the United States is now the highest among Group of 20 countries, and this boost means that unit labor costs in the United States have dropped more than in any G-20 country except Taiwan.

ourbadmedia.wordpress.com
Example #4 – „The Synonym Tango“

Bad attempts at paraphrasing?! → students often don't get what paraphrases are and why „rewrite what's already good“

Sounds different but no argumentation built, just imitation of „new text“/ re-owning
Our preliminary conclusions

Being more careful with **OUR wording** → for instance „being original“ is NOT a goal for student work!, what we really mean is: „create an **original context** with own thoughts and foreign ideas combined“

Handing out „symbol texts“ → explaining WHY and HOW they are good on a **FORMAL level** (selection of and dealing with literature, argumentation techniques, etc.)

Making „information surrounding“ of students a topic in class → discuss usage of ideas, texts, etc. **inside and outside of university**
Our preliminary conclusions

Teach **WHY we cite** in sciences, what functions do citations have in texts?

Use „plagiarism detection software“ (text analysis programs) **as originally intended** → show students early on how to improve their writing

Students should **read more (focussed)!**

**More argumentation training** – make presentation and discussion of students' ideas worth something!

**Value creation process** of a text much **HIGHER!**
Discussion

How can we teach our students the different concepts of re-own & re-use (better)?

Can HE institutions learn something useful from „the way of the artist“?
Contact

Prof. Dr. Petra Hauptfeld
Lecturer @ University of Applied Sciences Burgenland
Eisenstadt, Austria

E-Mail: Petra.Hauptfeld-Goellner@fh-burgenland.at
Website: www.fh-burgenland.at

Dr. Natascha Miljković
Science counsellor & lecturer @ Agency „Zitier-Weise“
Vienna, Austria

E-Mail: office@plagiatpruefung.at
Website: www.plagiatpruefung.at