Presentation Outline

- Introduction and Context
- Critical Observations
- The Concept of Plagiarism
- Definitions and Approaches
- Types of Plagiarism
- Perplexities: Problems and Challenges
- Towards a Plagiarism Framework for Educators
- Strategies and Solutions
Introduction and Context

- My background: recent academic, previous career in higher education management/planning/QA
- My context: HRM module in the business school, large numbers of students from diverse cultural and educational backgrounds – many of whom have *never* written an academic essay before
- Annually grade around 300 first-year essays
- Alarm at the high levels of plagiarism, and little sign of improvement over the years, despite earnest, system-wide efforts
- Needed help in understanding, identifying and evaluating plagiarism... hence this study
Plagiarism has always been - and remains - one of the most universal and stubborn problems in higher education (no shortage of research!)

It has been researched from every angle: philosophical, cultural, pedagogical, technological... even an entire international conference is dedicated to the issue

Estimates vary but conservatively, over 70% of students cheat in one form or another during their studies... UAE survey - over 80% admit to cheating, over 40% believe copy-paste is not cheating (Nanath, 2017)

Whilst technology has helped hugely in detecting plagiarism, it has also made the act of plagiarising so much easier

Very few cases are detected, and even fewer are reported

Despite the never-ending research, education, prevention and detection efforts, plagiarism and its challenges seem to be increasing rather than decreasing...

Do we need a new approach?
The Concept of Plagiarism

Originality, I fear, is too often only undetected and frequently unconscious plagiarism.

— William Ralph Inge —
The Concept of Plagiarism

To steal ideas from one person is plagiarism; to steal from many is research.

Steven Wright
The Concept of Plagiarism

- Based on a Western-centric, capitalist view of property and ownership (Evering and Moorman, 2012)
- The notion of public commons – an alternative view of ownership of ideas and knowledge, which are seen as belonging to everybody and to nobody
- Today’s students have a different relationship with knowledge to their parents and teachers
- Many believe anything available online is free and does not need acknowledgement
- Think about the last time you shared something you found on social media...
Plagiarism: Definitions and Approaches

- Presenting another’s ideas or words as your own
- Plagiarus = “kidnapper” (Latin)
- “Theft among friends” (Walker, 1998)
- A “breach of trust... we feel cheated and fooled” (Freckleton, 2016)
- Many HEI’s have unsophisticated or outdated policies and/or weak implementation
- Most policies see plagiarists as ‘crooks to be caught’
- Most policies focus on undergraduate students, not postgraduates or staff
Types of Plagiarism

Various kinds and levels of plagiarism have been identified, and new forms of plagiarism are constantly emerging

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TYPE</th>
<th>DESCRIPTION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Unintentional/accidental plagiarism</td>
<td>Where a person copies or paraphrases from a source without attribution but appears to be unaware of the concept of plagiarism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illicit paraphrasing</td>
<td>Where a person paraphrases another's work but omits to cite the source</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aggregation</td>
<td>Citations are provided, but the paper contains almost no original work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TYPE</td>
<td>DESCRIPTION</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Copy-paste</td>
<td>Where text is copied and pasted directly from the source, without attribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Find-replace</td>
<td>Copy-pasting, then exchanging key words for synonyms in order to avoid detection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mosaic/re-mix/shake and paste</td>
<td>Material is copied in small sections from various sources and 'quilted' together without attribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pawn Sacrifice/hybrid</td>
<td>Where plagiarized material is only partially cited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-plagiarism/recycling</td>
<td>Where the same work is submitted for more than one assignment/class/publication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>404 Error</td>
<td>Citations are provided, but are fictional or inaccurate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghost-writing/contract cheating/essay mills</td>
<td>Material is intentionally written by a third party for submission as one's own</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Translation</td>
<td>Where texts (or certain letters) are translated from another language without acknowledgement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cloning/purloining</td>
<td>Submitting someone else's work as one's own without their knowledge</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Identity alludes to the individual comportment of a representative towards an errand given to them on the substructure of the strenuousness of the undertaking. The Sizably voluminous Five identity structure was in charge of these identity attributes. The five identity attributes in an association are: extraversion in which the representatives associate with one another in distinctive human asset offices and stay dynamic, appropriateness in which workers rely on upon one another and benefit and trust each other to perfect a target, principles where representatives are composed which profits them in arranging future objectives and advancements of the association, passionate solidness where workers are peaceful while noting inquiries they are solicited predicated on the specialization from their field in the association and convincingly openness to involvement in which representatives are for the most part psyche shrewd and inventive while cerebrating of beginning originations to transmute the association.
BlaBlaWriting: A Favourite Essay Mill

GOVINDA IRA VENKATASWAMY who founded the ARVIND EYE CARE HOSPITAL in 1976(based on the concept of McDONALDIZATION) because of his passionate concern to eradicate the problem of needless blindness in India.

This essay will analyse the impact of applying these principles of McDONALDIZATION to Arvind eye care hospital and will discuss the journey and achievements of this world largest eye care provider of the world while referring to its great positive impact on the poorer sections of the society. Firstly we will talk about the problem of needless blindness in India which led to the evolution of aravind eye care hospitals. Then we discuss about the concept of McDONALDIZATION and its impact on aravind eye care hospitals and the leadership qualities of Dr. Venkataswamy that lead to increase the efficiency of the hospitals from two to seven times and finally conclude the global impact, advantages and contribution of this great health care system.

Is this the essay you need?
Arvind Hospital Sample
can be edited (94%) to fit any specification.
You will receive a unique essay for only $12.9 per page!
Perplexities: Why is plagiarism so prevalent and persistent?

Some of the motivations suggested in the literature include:

- Intentional, related to pressure from society to 'get ahead' at any cost
- High schools not teaching proper paraphrasing
- Some teachers actually encouraging copy-pasting from the internet
- Students not having confidence in their own ideas (educational background)
- Not understanding the assignment/assignment is way above academic level
- Being scared to ask for help
- Rich/entitled/lazy (want to get the highest grade for the least effort)
- Poor time management skills (panic at the last minute)
- Cost-benefit analysis: only warning or counselling if caught
- Financial pressures (high cost of studies, can't afford to fail)
- Cultural reasons (family 'honour' would be damaged if the student fails)

Plus, a worldwide culture of cheating (Callahan, 2004). Students see others doing it without serious consequences - in many cases people see dishonest behaviour being rewarded. The examples are everywhere…
Some examples of public plagiarism and a culture of cheating...  (Freckleton, 2016)

- Companies misrepresent their earnings
- Market analysts inflate stock ratings
- Job applicants 'improve' their CV's
- Athletes use performance-enhancing drugs
- Journalists fictionalize sources and stories
- People pirate movies and music without a qualm
- Melania Trump plagiarized Michelle Obama’s 2008 Democratic Convention speech in 2017
- Joe Biden plagiarized 5 pages in a law assignment at Syracuse University
- David Robinson resigned as VC of Monash University in Australia in 2002 when plagiarism was proven
- The President of Hungary, Pal Schmidt, had his doctorate withdrawn in 2012
- As did Victor Ponta, Prime Minister of Romania in the same year
- The case of Dave Tomar, academic ghostwriter from Rutger’s University- US$66000, 5000 pages per annum, including on ethics! (Berret, 2012)
Are Academics Part of the Problem?

- Plagiarism is higher in classes where teachers are lenient.
- Numerous documented cases of academic fraud.
- A study by Adele Thomas and others (2015) at the University of Johannesburg interrogated 371 articles published in 19 South African management journals.
- They found that 50% contained some level of plagiarism according to the text-matching software Turnitin.
- Thomas also surveyed over 900 academics to investigate why most don't report student plagiarism and discovered an answer many of us might identify with...
- LOTS of bureaucracy and paperwork is involved, as well as personal discomfort and not wanting to jeopardize their student's progression or their own teaching evaluations.
Technology: Problems and Challenges

- Text-matching works poorly for paraphrasing and key-word replacement and cannot detect ghostwriting or essay mills at all (plagiarism beneath the radar)
- Many academics don’t fully understand or use the available technology appropriately (a high similarity could just indicate many students using the same sources)
- What level of similarity is acceptable? 20%? 50%?? (Walker, 1998)
- Millennials are digitally literate in ways their teachers often are not
- Video games “encourage risky deceptions which cheat the system” (Nelson, 2012)
- Plagiarists are usually one step ahead of the latest plagiarism-detection developments
- “Using Turnitin as a policing mechanism rather than an educational tool means we are delegating to technology that which should be fundamental to education: developing in our students the ability to construct written knowledge in academically powerful ways.” (McKenna, 2015)
- Using a technological fix to address a moral problem is futile
Towards a Plagiarism Framework

- Most educational institutions already have accepted policies and practices in place regarding their approach to plagiarism.
- However, the majority are reactive rather than proactive.
- Many are "poorly defined [and there is] little evidence of monitoring and review" (Glendinning, 2014).
- Policies may not cover all relevant areas or provide sufficient guidance on practicalities such as how to recognize and deal with different types of plagiarism.
- Whilst case-by-case flexibility and the personal judgment of experienced professionals should be retained as far as possible, a generic plagiarism framework would be a useful starting point in providing essential information and ensuring consistency in application.
- In particular, a formal set of criteria by which to interpret and judge the type, severity and possible consequences of plagiarism.
Issues for Institutional Consideration

- Should there be a prescribed set of rules/guidelines or should interpretation of the policy be left entirely to the judgment of the academics concerned?
- Would one set of guidelines work across different subject areas and assessment types?
- Would the consequences for plagiarism be the same for postgraduate students as for undergraduate students for example? For first time vs repeat offenders? For staff?
- Is there even a requirement for staff to check similarity before publication?
- When setting up the Turnitin submission inbox do you include or exclude quotes and references? Short matches? (These decisions can make a massive difference to the similarity score.)
- What percentage of Turnitin similarity is considered unacceptable: over 20%? over 50%?
Plagiarism Framework Outline

- **SCOPE** – areas and levels affected, institutional and national context
- **DEFINITIONS** – explanation of terms and types, statement regarding expected behaviour
- **INSTITUTIONAL POLICIES AND STRATEGIC GOALS** – relationship to existing policies and institutional goals
- **APPROACH TO PLAGIARISM** – institution’s understanding of the concept plus criteria used to assess the severity of the offence
- **EVIDENCE** – categories and examples of evidence sources
- **CONSEQUENCES AND PENALTIES** – including examples
- **REPORTING PROCEDURES** – practical steps and mechanisms including timelines and decision trees
- **SUPPORT AVAILABLE** – kinds and extent of support available to those requiring assistance in identifying plagiarism as well as avoiding it
- **FORMS/TEMPLATES** – preferably electronic links, ensuring consistency and that the latest versions are always used
Decision Tree: Academic Level

- **LEVEL**
  - **first year**
    - first offence
    - second offence
  - **other undergraduate**
    - first offence
    - second offence
  - **postgraduate**
    - first offence
    - second offence
  - **staff**
    - first offence

- teachable moment / counselling
- formal reporting
- resubmission
- formal reporting
- formal reporting
- exclusion
- termination of employment
Decision Tree: Intention

**INTENTION**

- Ignorance
  - Course completion requirement
  - Resubmission
  - Grade penalty
- Academic Negligence
- Deliberate
  - Formal Reporting/Disciplinary Action
Decision Tree: Type

TYPE OF PLAGIARISM

- accidental
  - counselling
- Illicit paraphrasing or aggregation
  - resubmission
- copy-paste find-replace mosaic self-plagiarism
  - formal reporting
  - zero grade
- Ghost-writing contract cheating translation cloning
  - zero grade and disciplinary action
Strategies and Solutions (1)

- Accept that plagiarism will never be eliminated
- Acknowledge human nature and the ‘cheating culture’ and address it at every opportunity in your teaching
- Support efforts to develop international guidelines, especially regarding essay mills
- Regularly review and update plagiarism policies, ensure buy-in from senior leadership
- Distinguish between intentional plagiarism and academic negligence (and ensure penalties match)
- Take no prisoners where intentional plagiarism is proven and provide feedback to the university community (and where necessary, the public) on action taken
- Monitor the quality of staff publications (check for plagiarism?)
Strategies and Solutions (2)

- Take responsibility for enabling plagiarism – do not set the same assignments year after year
- Use text-matching software as a learning tool (allow multiple submissions)
- Redesign assessments to avoid the potential for plagiarism (more continuous assessment, more oral presentations, fewer essays, break assessments into sections - each with separate deadlines, change the prescribed readings etc)
- Ensure assessments are appropriate to the level/year of study
- Develop personal relationships with students, get to know their style of writing
- Provide real-life examples of old and new types of plagiarism to students
- See every instance of academic negligence as a teachable moment
- Help students ‘reorder their relationship with the internet’ – teach them to differentiate between knowledge and content and understand that there is no short-cut to learning
- Appeal to students’ ethical futures “what kind of teacher/lawyer/doctor/psychologist/leader/parent will you be...?”
BOOK REPORTS DUE TODAY!

“It’s not called ‘plagiarism’ anymore. It’s ‘pre-packaged originality’.”
Thank you!
References


Callahan, D (2004). The Cheating Culture: Why More Americans are Doing Wrong to Get Ahead. Harcourt


Culwin, F and Lancaster, (2001b). Plagiarism, Prevention, Deterrence and Detection. Available online at https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/1f64/049e565b45be57a0c58e0ccfc673293dd7ba.pdf

Evering, LC and Moorman, G (2012). Rethinking Plagiarism in the Digital Age. Journal of Adolescent and Adult Literacy 56 (1) pp35-44


References

McKenna, S (2017) The misuses of Turnitin and other text-matching software. Available online at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3Uf2ZI2tpMg#action=share


Ratedbystudents (26 May 2016). Five Ways to Trick Turnitin for Students. Available at http://ratedbystudents.com/tips/5-ways-to-trick-turnitin-for-students


Sharma, S (2 Oct 2014). How To Copy Everything from Internet and Still Avoid Plagiarism. Available at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=TftG_54jYDo


Thomas, A. (2015a). Dishonest academics may make students think plagiarism is acceptable. Available online at https://theconversation.com/dishonest-academics-may-make-students-think-plagiarism-is-acceptable-45187


